

1 **Mortality benefits of vigorous air quality improvement interventions during the**
2 **periods of APEC Blue and Parade Blue in Beijing, China**

3

4 Hualiang Lin ¹, Tao Liu ¹, Fang Fang ², Jianpeng Xiao ¹, Weilin Zeng ¹, Xing Li ¹,
5 Lingchuan Guo ¹, Linwei Tian ³, Mario Schoutman ², Katherine A. Stamatakis ²,
6 Zhengmin Qian ^{2,*}, Wenjun Ma ^{1,*}

7

8 ¹ Guangdong Provincial Institute of Public Health, Guangdong Provincial Center for
9 Disease Control and Prevention, Guangzhou, China; ² College for Public Health and
10 Social Justice, Saint Louis University, Saint Louis, US; ³ School of Public Health, Li Ka
11 Shing Faculty of Medicine, The University of Hong Kong, 21 Sassoon Road, Pokfulam,
12 Hong Kong, China

13

14 **Correspondence to:** Zhengmin Qian, zqian2@slu.edu, Wenjun Ma, mawj@gdiph.org.cn

15

16 **Word count:** 3,733

17

18

19 **ABSTRACT**

20 Vigorous air pollution control measures were implemented during the 2014 Asia-Pacific
21 Economic Cooperation and a large-scale military parade (described here as "APEC Blue"
22 and "Parade Blue" periods) in Beijing, China. A natural experiment was conducted in a
23 health impact assessment framework to estimate the number of deaths attributable to
24 PM_{2.5}, using concentration-response functions derived from previous studies conducted in
25 Beijing, combined with the differences in PM_{2.5} concentrations between intervention and
26 reference periods. Substantial reductions in daily PM_{2.5} concentrations were observed
27 during both intervention periods. Using the same dates from the prior year as a reference,
28 daily PM_{2.5} concentration decreased from 98.57 µg/m³ to 47.53 µg/m³ during "APEC
29 Blue", and from 59.15µg/m³ to 17.07µg/m³ during the "Parade Blue". We estimated that
30 39 to 63 all-cause deaths (21 to 51 cardiovascular, 6 to 13 respiratory deaths) have been
31 prevented during the APEC period; and 41 to 65 deaths (22 to 52 cardiovascular, 6 to 13
32 respiratory deaths) have been prevented during the Parade period. This study shows that
33 substantial mortality reductions could be achieved by implementing stringent air
34 pollution mitigation measures.

35

36 **Capsule:** There were about 50% reductions in daily PM_{2.5} concentrations during the
37 APEC and Parade Blue periods compared with the reference periods, and we estimated
38 that the air pollution improvement intervention measures resulted in substantial mortality
39 reductions.

40

41 **Keywords:** Air pollution; Intervention; APEC Blue; Mortality; Beijing

42

43

44 **1. Introduction**

45 Air pollution is regarded as an important environmental risk factor of morbidity and
46 mortality around the world (Krall et al. 2013, Landrigan et al. 2015). The World Health
47 Organization (WHO) estimated that 3.7 million premature deaths in 2012 were
48 attributable to ambient air pollution (World Health Organization 2014).

49 Several biological mechanisms support the short-term association between ambient
50 fine particulate matter air pollution (PM_{2.5}) exposure and mortality. For example, inhaled
51 particles, deposited in the pulmonary tract, can elicit and exacerbate both pulmonary and
52 systemic inflammation and oxidative stress, resulting in direct pulmonary and vascular
53 damage, atherosclerosis, and autonomic dysfunction (Dockery and Stone 2007). In a
54 quasi-experimental study examining the air pollution control program during the 2008
55 Beijing Olympics, the investigators found that the diminished air pollution concentration
56 was followed by acute changes in the systemic inflammation biomarkers in healthy adults
57 (Rich et al. 2012).

58 Such links between air pollution and adverse health outcomes have prompted
59 governments to develop effective environmental policy and air quality legislation in order
60 to safeguard the public's health (Ministry of Environmental Protection of China 2012). In
61 recent years, anthropogenic air pollution control programs have been implemented in a
62 number of countries, particularly during large-scale events, such as the Olympic Games,
63 the Asian Games, and some political events (Friedman et al. 2001, Li et al. 2010, Tao et
64 al. 2015). These programs have provided unique opportunities to quantitatively evaluate
65 the public health impacts resulting from environmental regulatory policies (Rich et al.
66 2012, Lin et al. 2014), also known as accountability research, a necessary component of
67 governmental policy development and evaluation (Dominici et al. 2007, Henschel et al.
68 2012).

69 Vigorous air pollution control measures were put into effect in Beijing, the capital of
70 China, during the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) Summit in 2014, and the
71 2015 China large-scale military parade (Johnston et al. 2013, Zheng et al. 2016). This
72 effort significantly improved the ambient air quality, which was coined as "APEC Blue"
73 and "Parade Blue", respectively (Wen et al. 2015, Shi et al. 2016). Yet, to what extent air

74 pollutants, especially particulate matter equal to or less than 2.5 μm in diameter ($\text{PM}_{2.5}$),
75 were reduced because of these measures, and how these reductions were associated with
76 mortality reduction during these two intervention periods remained unclear. Therefore, as
77 an accountability analysis, this study compared the $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ concentrations during the
78 intervention periods with the reference periods and evaluated the potential mortality
79 reduction based on a health impact assessment framework. We hypothesized that reduced
80 air pollution by the intervention measures could significantly reduce mortality risk during
81 the intervention periods.

82

83 **2. Materials and methods**

84 **2.1 Setting**

85 Beijing, located in northern China, is the capital of the People's Republic of China
86 and one of the most populous cities in the world. Its population in 2013 was 21.2 million.
87 The typical climate in Beijing is a combination of temperate and continental monsoon
88 climates with four distinct seasons. The summer is hot and humid and the hottest month
89 is July with an average temperature of 26 °C (79 °F). The winter is cold and dry with the
90 coldest month of January presenting an average temperature of -4 °C (25 °F).

91 Alongside its rapid economic development, in recent years Beijing has become
92 infamous for serious air pollution problems (Rich et al. 2012). It is no strange for its sky
93 to be completely shrouded by a filthy film of gray smog. Six urban districts in Beijing
94 with elevated air pollution levels were selected for this study because they were more
95 likely to be affected by the air pollution control measures described below, which
96 provided the opportunity to conduct the current study in the context of a “natural
97 experiment” design.

98

99 **2.2 APEC Blue**

100 On November 5th through the 11th, 2014, China hosted the APEC Leaders' Meeting
101 in Beijing. To improve the city's air quality, the government enforced strict air pollution
102 control measures in Beijing and neighboring regions from November 1st to the 12th, 2014.
103 The detailed emission control measures have been described elsewhere (Li et al. 2015a).

104 In brief, the targeted sources included emission control for point source (construction,
105 paint, and solvent use), area source (industry, steel factories, chemical factories, power
106 plants, etc), and on-road mobile source (vehicle emissions). As a result, air quality was
107 greatly improved, and the phrase “APEC Blue” was coined to refer to the blue sky during
108 this period (Li et al. 2015b).

109

110 **2.3 Parade Blue**

111 On August 20th, 2015, the Chinese authorities implemented air pollution control
112 measures to ensure a blue sky for the 2015 China Victory Day Parade, which was held on
113 September 3rd, 2015 to celebrate the 70th anniversary of the end of the Second World War.
114 Control measures included restrictions on construction, factory production, and car use.
115 During this period, limited car use affected five million car owners; hundreds of factories
116 were closed; 40,000 construction sites in and around Beijing were shut down. On August
117 20th, air pollution levels in Beijing dropped dramatically, resulting in the city’s usually
118 smoggy skies to be “picture-perfect blue”, which was entitled “Parade Blue” (Shi et al.
119 2016).

120

121 **2.4 Estimates of mortality effects of a unit change in daily PM_{2.5} concentration**

122 To estimate the changes in mortality associated with decreased PM_{2.5} concentrations
123 during the APEC and the Parade periods, we conducted a health impact assessment using
124 an approach proposed by the WHO (World Health Organization 2001a, World Health
125 Organization 2001b). The health impact assessment was conducted based on
126 exposure-response function and data about population size, baseline mortality, and air
127 pollution concentrations during the intervention period and reference period. We based
128 our analysis on a log-linear relationship between daily particulate matter air pollution
129 concentrations and mortality in China (Chen et al. 2012, Lin et al. 2016b). The WHO also
130 advised that the air pollution-health relationship is approximately linear (World Health
131 Organization 2003).

132 We obtained the all-cause mortality risk (excluding injury and poisoning),
133 cardiovascular mortality, and respiratory mortality from previously published time-series

134 studies conducted in Beijing. According to one study (Li et al. 2015c), a 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$
 135 increase in daily $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ concentration in Beijing would lead to a 0.28% [95% confidence
 136 interval (CI): 0.18%-0.41%] increase in all-cause mortality, a 0.32% (95% CI:
 137 0.16%-0.47%) increase in cardiovascular mortality, and a 0.31% (95% CI: 0.01%-0.63%)
 138 increase in respiratory mortality. Another study (Li et al. 2014) found that the excess
 139 mortality risk for every 36 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ increase was 1.52% (95% CI: 1.07%-1.99%) in
 140 Beijing. Table 1 shows the estimates of the short-term association between $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ and
 141 mortality from all-cause, cardiovascular, and respiratory diseases in Beijing among these
 142 studies, from which we also calculated a range of estimates of the number of preventable
 143 deaths.

144

145 **Table 1 The association between daily $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ and mortality obtained from previous**
 146 **studies in Beijing, China**

Death cause	Study period	$\text{PM}_{2.5}$ concentration ($\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$)	ER (95% CI)	β (95% CI, $*10^{-4}$)
All-cause				
Guo, 2013(Guo et al. 2013)	2004-2008	94	2.5 (0.6, 4.5)	2.63 (0.64, 4.68)
Li, 2014(Li et al. 2014)	2005-2009	36	1.52 (1.07-1.99)	4.19 (2.96, 5.47)
Li, 2015(Li et al. 2015c)	2008-2011	10	0.28 (0.18-0.41)	2.80 (1.80, 4.09)
CVD mortality				
Dong, 2013(Dong et al. 2013)	2007-2008	10	0.78 (0.07-1.49)	7.77 (0.70, 14.79)
Li, 2015(Li et al. 2015c)	2008-2011	10	0.32 (0.16-0.47)	3.19 (1.60, 4.69)
Respiratory mortality				
Li, 2013(Li et al. 2013)	2004-2009	10	0.69 (0.54-0.85)	6.88 (5.39, 8.46)
Li, 2015(Li et al. 2015c)	2008-2011	10	0.31 (0.01-0.63)	3.10 (0.10, 6.28)

147 Note: No. of units means number of units (in $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$) for the corresponding excess risk of
 148 mortality reported in the original study; ER refers to excess mortality risk; and β and its
 149 95% CI refer to coefficients and corresponding 95% CI for the association between daily
 150 $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ (1 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$) and mortality.

151

152 2.5 Change in $\text{PM}_{2.5}$ concentration compared with reference period

153 We used two different reference periods to calculate the changes in air pollution
 154 concentration relative to the intervention periods. The first reference period (Reference I)
 155 was the average concentration during the same calendar dates of the previous year:

156 November 1st to the 12th , 2013, for the APEC period and August 20th to September 3rd ,
157 2014, for the Parade period. The second reference period (Reference II) was the
158 near-term reference period with the same distribution of days of the week: October 18th to
159 the 29th , 2014, for the APEC period and July 30th to August 13th , 2015, for the Parade
160 period. We collected daily air pollution data in Beijing, including the levels of PM_{2.5},
161 sulfur dioxide (SO₂), and nitrogen dioxide (NO₂) from the Chinese Environmental
162 Monitoring Center (<http://www.cnemc.cn/>). Additionally, daily meteorological data for
163 the same period, including daily mean temperature (°C) and relative humidity (%) data,
164 were obtained from the Chinese National Weather Data Sharing System
165 (<http://cdc.cma.gov.cn/home.do>).

166

167 **2.6 Baseline number of outcome events**

168 We assumed that the size of the baseline population changed minimally within the
169 study period so that the person-time units in the denominators of the mortality rates
170 remained constant; this allowed us to compare the daily mortality counts in the
171 intervention and reference periods using rate ratios (RRs), which is defined as the ratio of
172 the number of deaths in the intervention period and the number of deaths during the
173 reference periods. We calculated the daily mortality count based on the population and
174 the mortality rate in Beijing. According to the sixth census data, there were 12.76 million
175 residents in 6 urban districts in Beijing. Based on an overall annual mortality rate of
176 seven per thousand, the daily mortality count would be 245. According to a previous
177 study (Ma et al. 2015), among the overall mortalities, the proportions of cardiovascular
178 mortality and respiratory mortality were 43.74% and 12.32%, respectively; so it was
179 estimated that there were about 107 and 30 deaths from cardiovascular and respiratory
180 diseases respectively each day in the study areas.

181

182 **2.7 Statistical analysis**

183 Measures of PM_{2.5}-mortality association is reported as relative risk (RR) or excess
184 risk (ER). To determine the increase in PM_{2.5} , concentrations were first converted into a
185 regression coefficient (β) for each $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ change using the formula: $\beta = \ln(\text{RR})/\text{unit} =$

186 $\ln(1+ER)/\text{unit}$; and the 95% confidence interval for β : $\beta_{\text{lower}} = \ln(RR_{\text{lower}})/\text{unit} =$
 187 $\ln(1+ER_{\text{lower}})/\text{unit}$, $\beta_{\text{upper}} = \ln(RR_{\text{upper}})/\text{unit} = \ln(1+ER_{\text{upper}})/\text{unit}$. Where RR_{lower} and
 188 RR_{upper} are the lower and upper limits of the 95% CI of RR, and ER_{lower} and ER_{upper} are
 189 the lower and upper limits of the 95% CI of ER. We then calculated the number of
 190 prevented deaths attributed to the decreased $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations based on the following
 191 formula (Lin et al. 2016a):

$$192 \Delta \text{number of mortality} = \text{baseline mortality} * [\exp(\beta * \Delta PC) - 1]$$

193 The 95% CI of the mortality benefits was estimated using the following formula(s):

$$194 \Delta \text{lower limit of number of mortality} = \text{baseline mortality} * [\exp(\beta_{\text{lower}} * \Delta PC) - 1]$$

$$195 \Delta \text{upper limit of number of mortality} = \text{baseline mortality} * [\exp(\beta_{\text{upper}} * \Delta PC) - 1]$$

196

197 Where Δ number of mortality is the estimated change in the number of deaths, β is the
 198 coefficient of association between daily $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations (per $1\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ increase) and
 199 mortality, and ΔPC is the change in ambient $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations (i.e., the difference
 200 between the reference and intervention periods).

201

202 3. Results

203 Table 2 summarizes the daily air pollution and meteorological conditions during the
 204 intervention and the reference periods in Beijing. Significant reductions were observed
 205 during the intervention periods when compared with the reference periods for both the
 206 "APEC Blue" and the "Parade Blue" events.

207

208 **Table 2 Comparison of air pollutants and meteorological variables between**
 209 **intervention and reference periods**

Variable	Intervention	Reference I		Reference II	
		Baseline	Change	Baseline	Change
APEC Blue (12 days)					
Air pollutants					
$PM_{2.5}$ ($\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$)	47.53	98.57	51.04	138.19	90.66
SO_2 ($\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$)	9.90	20.58	10.68	13.57	3.67
NO_2 ($\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$)	50.64	69.47	18.83	91.33	40.69
Meteorological					
Temperature ($^{\circ}\text{C}$)	6.46	7.05	0.59	11.37	4.91

Humidity (%)	45.33	52.81	7.48	65.06	19.73
Parade Blue (15 days)					
Air pollutants					
PM _{2.5} (µg/m ³)	17.07	59.15	42.08	70.09	53.02
SO ₂ (µg/m ³)	4.91	6.27	1.36	7.73	2.82
NO ₂ (µg/m ³)	21.64	34.83	13.19	53.21	31.57
Meteorological					
Temperature (°C)	25.15	25.07	-0.08	27.17	2.02
Humidity (%)	65.06	64.47	-0.59	65.47	0.41

210

211 During the "APEC Blue" period in 2014, daily PM_{2.5} concentrations fell to 47.53
 212 µg/m³, attaining WHO's air quality guideline Interim Target II (50 µg/m³), corresponding
 213 to a 51.78% reduction compared to the same calendar dates of the previous year
 214 (Reference I, 98.57 µg/m³) and a 65.61% reduction compared to the pre-intervention
 215 period (Reference II, 138.19µg/m³). The reduction of daily SO₂ and NO₂ concentrations
 216 was 51.90% and 27.11% compared to Reference I, and 27.04% and 44.55% compared to
 217 Reference II. The daily mean temperature during the intervention period was similar to
 218 that during the Reference I period, but lower than that during the Reference II period.

219 During the "Parade Blue" period in 2015, daily PM_{2.5} concentration decreased
 220 71.14% from 59.15 µg/m³ on the same calendar dates in 2014 (Reference I) to 17.07
 221 µg/m³ and 75.65% from 70.09 µg/m³ during the pre-intervention period (Reference II) to
 222 17.07 µg/m³ (Table 2). The PM_{2.5} concentrations during this period attained the ultimate
 223 goal of the WHO's air quality guideline (25 µg/m³). A decreasing pattern was also
 224 observed for other air pollutants, such as SO₂ and NO₂. The daily mean temperature was
 225 similar during the intervention period and the Reference I period, but lower than that of
 226 the Reference II period.

227

228 **Table 3** Estimated mortality benefits from air pollution controlling interventions during
 229 APEC Blue and Parade Blue periods in Beijing, China

	Reference I		Reference II	
	Δ Mortality	95% CI	Δ Mortality	95% CI
APEC Blue (12 days)				
All-cause mortality				
Guo, 2013	39	9-70	70	15-125

Li, 2015	42	23-61	75	40-109
Li, 2014	63	44-82	112	77-146
CVD mortality				
Li, 2015	21	11-31	37	20-55
Dong, 2013	51	5-97	90	9-172
Respiratory mortality				
Li, 2013	13	10-16	22	17-28
Li, 2015	6	0-12	10	0-20
Parade Blue (15 days)				
All-cause mortality				
Guo, 2013	41	10-72	51	12-91
Li, 2015	43	28-63	54	35-80
Li, 2014	65	46-85	82	58-107
CVD mortality				
Li, 2015	22	11-32	27	14-40
Dong, 2013	52	5-100	66	6-126
Respiratory mortality				
Li, 2013	13	10-16	16	13-20
Li, 2015	6	0-12	7	0-15

230 Note: 95% CI: 95% confidence interval.

231

232 Table 3 illustrates the reductions in daily mortality as a result of a reduction in PM_{2.5}
 233 levels during the intervention periods in Beijing. We estimated that, during the APEC
 234 period, the reductions in all-cause mortality ranged from 39 to 63 compared to the
 235 Reference I period, and from 70 to 112 compared to the Reference II period. The
 236 estimated number of prevented cardiovascular deaths ranged from 21 to 51 (Reference I),
 237 and from 37 to 90 (Reference II). The reduction in respiratory mortality ranged from 6 to
 238 13 (Reference I), and from 10 to 22 (Reference II).

239 Significant premature mortality reductions were also observed during the Parade
 240 intervention period in Beijing. During the 15-day intervention period, 41 to 65 deaths and
 241 51 to 82 deaths were estimated to be prevented compared to the Reference I period and
 242 the Reference II period, respectively. The prevented cardiovascular mortality was
 243 estimated to range from 22 to 52 (Reference I), and from 27 to 66 (Reference II); the
 244 reduction in respiratory mortality would range from 6 to 13 (Reference I), and from 7 to
 245 16 (Reference II).

246

247 **4. Discussion**

248 The results of our study suggested that air pollution control measures implemented in
249 Beijing during the discrete time periods described as “APEC Blue” and “Parade Blue”
250 were associated with substantial mortality reductions. Similar temporary and strict air
251 quality improvement policies have been conducted during several large-scale events in
252 China, such as the 2008 Beijing Olympic Games (Jia et al. 2009), the 2010 Guangzhou
253 Asian Games (Lin et al. 2014, Tao et al. 2015), and more recently, the APEC meeting and
254 the military parade in Beijing as described (Li et al. 2015b). Evaluation of the mortality
255 benefits of air pollution control measures in the context of natural experiments such as
256 the current study provided compelling evidence that extensive control measures are both
257 feasible and essential for improving public health (Bell et al. 2011, Fann et al. 2012).

258 Alongside the economic development, China has been facing severe air pollution
259 problems, which has gained international attention in recent years (Chen et al. 2013).
260 Evidence of the association between particulate air pollution and increased mortality has
261 been accumulating in the past decades. Both time-series studies and case-crossover
262 studies have demonstrated short-term effects of particulate air pollution on human health
263 (Kan et al. 2007, Peng et al. 2012, Lin et al. 2016b). Based on this, our study estimated
264 the health benefits from lowering particulate air pollution concentrations by controlling
265 air pollution emissions through citywide transportation regulation and industrial emission
266 controls. We estimated that about 39-112 (1.33%-3.81% of daily mortality) and 41-82
267 (1.20%-2.39% of daily mortality) premature deaths were prevented during the APEC
268 period and the Parade period, respectively. The results were consistent with a number of
269 previous studies. Friedman and colleagues observed a substantial reduction in hospital
270 admissions during the 1996 Olympic Games when the alternative transportation policy
271 was put into effect to reduce vehicle exhaust (Friedman et al. 2001). Significant health
272 benefits, including asthma morbidity reduction, improved cardiac autonomic function
273 among young healthy adults, acute changes in biomarkers of inflammation and
274 thrombosis, and measures of cardiovascular physiology were reported during the 2008
275 Beijing Olympic Games (Li et al. 2010, Wu et al. 2010, Rich et al. 2012). Short-term
276 beneficial effects were also observed during the Asian Games in Korea, as well as the one

277 in China (Lee et al. 2007, Lin et al. 2014). Using a health impact assessment framework,
278 we illustrated that significant reductions in premature mortality could be achieved by
279 lowering daily PM_{2.5} levels in a heavily polluted Chinese city. Our results highlighted the
280 need for continuous and persistent efforts to improve ambient air quality in China.

281 A few limitations should be noted. First, this study estimated only the association
282 between prevented mortality and acute ambient PM_{2.5} reductions obtained by temporary
283 air quality improvement activities. We were likely to underestimate the health benefits of
284 PM_{2.5} reduction in Beijing, as various other medical conditions, which could benefit from
285 air quality improvement, were not evaluated in our analysis (Bell and Davis 2001, Liu et
286 al. 2016). As chronic medical conditions were common among the population, a large
287 number of residents were likely to be affected by pollution exacerbating milder
288 symptoms, which could not be investigated due to our limited access to the datasets.
289 Furthermore, even though our analysis focused on PM_{2.5}, significant reductions of other
290 mortality-associated air pollutants, such as SO₂ and NO₂ (Lin et al. 2013), were also
291 observed following the air pollution control measures (Table 2). Therefore, there might
292 be more health benefits related to vigorous air pollution intervention measures.

293 Second, ambient air pollution concentration served as a proxy for individual
294 exposure level. As previously reported, studies assessing air pollution by a fixed air
295 monitoring station might have underestimated the health effect (Mindell and Joffe 2004).
296 However, it was important to use the same measurement of exposure in the health impact
297 assessment as in the studies where the exposure-response functions were derived (World
298 Health Organization 2000). A simulation study on air pollution exposure assessment
299 showed that for PM_{2.5} concentrations measured by fixed local air monitoring stations
300 were adequate surrogates for personal exposures (Schwartz et al. 2007). In addition,
301 PM_{2.5} tended to be spatially homogeneous, indicating the representativeness of
302 monitor-based pollution levels for personal exposure (Monn 2001). Hence, the
303 association between residents' actual PM_{2.5} exposures and the measurement by a fixed air
304 monitor might not be substantially different in urban Beijing.

305 Third, different studies have used different model approaches, making it difficult to
306 compare results across studies of environmental health effects; in this respect, we

307 obtained coefficients of PM_{2.5}-mortality association in Beijing, by using results from
308 major studies done in the study city of Beijing. Doing so allowed us to estimate the health
309 co-benefits of PM_{2.5} reductions.

310 This study has important implications for environmental management and public
311 health protection. As air pollution becomes a severe problem for daily life, the growing
312 public concerns need to be addressed by a strong governmental response. Nationwide
313 policy development and implementation are needed to tackle air pollution problems and
314 to protect public health. Our results provided quantitative estimates of the mortality
315 benefits resulting from the air quality control measures that may support policy changes.
316 For example, in Australia, policy goals to achieve a daily mean PM_{2.5} of 8 µg/m³ have
317 been set and actions to improve air quality have been taken since 2003. Goals to reduce
318 daily mean PM_{2.5} in China will have important implications for improving public health,
319 as proposed by the scientific community and the WHO (World Health Organization
320 2006).

321 In conclusion, our findings suggest that substantial mortality benefits could be
322 achieved by lowering air pollution concentrations, particularly during large-scale events.
323 Air pollution control measures should be adopted as a regular practice to better safeguard
324 public health.

325

326 **Acknowledgements**

327 We thank the Beijing Municipal Environmental Monitoring Centre for publicly sharing
328 the air pollution data, as well as the Chinese Meteorological Data Sharing Service System
329 for providing meteorology data. This work was supported by the National Natural
330 Science Foundation of China [grant number 81202176].

331

332 **Conflicts of interest and source of funding**

333 None declared.

334

335

336 **References**

- 337 Bell, M. L. and Davis, D. L. (2001). Reassessment of the lethal London fog of 1952:
338 novel indicators of acute and chronic consequences of acute exposure to air
339 pollution. *Environmental health perspectives* **109**(Suppl 3): 389.
- 340 Bell, M. L., Morgenstern, R. D. and Harrington, W. (2011). Quantifying the human
341 health benefits of air pollution policies: Review of recent studies and new directions
342 in accountability research. *Environmental Science & Policy* **14**(4): 357-368.
- 343 Chen, R., Kan, H., Chen, B., Huang, W., Bai, Z., Song, G. and Pan, G. (2012).
344 Association of Particulate Air Pollution With Daily Mortality The China Air Pollution
345 and Health Effects Study. *American Journal of Epidemiology* **175**(11): 1173-1181.
- 346 Chen, Z., Wang, J. N., Ma, G. X. and Zhang, Y. S. (2013). China tackles the health
347 effects of air pollution. *The Lancet* **382**(9909): 1959-1960.
- 348 Dockery, D. W. and Stone, P. H. (2007). Cardiovascular risks from fine particulate air
349 pollution. *N Engl J Med.* **356**(5): 511-513.
- 350 Dominici, F., Peng, R. D., Zeger, S. L., White, R. H. and Samet, J. M. (2007). Particulate
351 Air Pollution and Mortality in the United States: Did the Risks Change from 1987 to
352 2000. *American Journal of Epidemiology* **166**(8): 880-888.
- 353 Dong, F., Mo, Y., Li, G., Xu, M. and Pan, X. (2013). Association between ambient
354 PM10/PM2.5 levels and population mortality of circulatory diseases: a case-crossover
355 study in Beijing. *Journal of Peking University. Health Sciences* **45**(3): 398-404.
- 356 Fann, N., Lamson, A. D., Anenberg, S. C., Wesson, K., Risley, D. and Hubbell, B. J.
357 (2012). Estimating the national public health burden associated with exposure to
358 ambient PM2. 5 and ozone. *Risk analysis* **32**(1): 81-95.
- 359 Friedman, M. S., Powell, K. E., Hutwagner, L., Graham, L. R. M. and Teague, W. G.
360 (2001). Impact of changes in transportation and commuting behaviors during the
361 1996 Summer Olympic Games in Atlanta on air quality and childhood asthma. *JAMA*
362 **285**(7): 897-905.
- 363 Guo, Y., Li, S., Tian, Z., Pan, X., Zhang, J. and Williams, G. (2013). The burden of air
364 pollution on years of life lost in Beijing, China, 2004-08: retrospective regression
365 analysis of daily deaths. *BMJ* **347**.
- 366 Henschel, S., Atkinson, R., Zeka, A., Le Tertre, A., Analitis, A., Katsouyanni, K., Chanel,
367 O., Pascal, M., Forsberg, B. and Medina, S. (2012). Air pollution interventions and
368 their impact on public health. *International Journal of Public Health* **57**(5): 757-768.
- 369 Jia, Y., Guo, Y., Pan, X., Wang, Z., Xie, Y., Tang, X. and Zhu, T. (2009). The Relationship
370 Between Air Pollution Reduction and Heart Rate Variability in Aged Susceptible
371 People During Beijing Olympic Games in 2008. *Epidemiology* **20**(6): S125.
- 372 Johnston, F. H., Hanigan, I. C., Henderson, S. B. and Morgan, G. G. (2013). Evaluation
373 of interventions to reduce air pollution from biomass smoke on mortality in
374 Launceston, Australia: retrospective analysis of daily mortality, 1994-2007. *BMJ:*
375 *British Medical Journal* **346**.
- 376 Kan, H., London, S. J., Chen, G., Zhang, Y., Song, G., Zhao, N., Jiang, L. and Chen, B.

- 377 (2007). Differentiating the effects of fine and coarse particles on daily mortality in
378 Shanghai, China. *Environ Int.* **33**(3): 376-384.
- 379 Krall, J. R., Anderson, G. B., Dominici, F., Bell, M. L. and Peng, R. D. (2013). Short-term
380 exposure to particulate matter constituents and mortality in a national study of US
381 urban communities.
- 382 Landrigan, P. J., Fuller, R. and Horton, R. (2015). Environmental pollution, health, and
383 development: a Lancet-Global Alliance on Health and Pollution-Icahn School of
384 Medicine at Mount Sinai Commission. *Lancet* (London, England) **386**(10002): 1429.
- 385 Lee, J. T., Son, J. Y. and Cho, Y. S. (2007). Benefits of mitigated ambient air quality due
386 to transportation control on childhood asthma hospitalization during the 2002
387 summer asian games in Busan, Korea. *J Air Waste Manag Assoc.* **57**(8): 968-973.
- 388 Li, J., Xie, S., Zeng, L., Li, L., Li, Y. and Wu, R. (2015a). Characterization of ambient
389 volatile organic compounds and their sources in Beijing, before, during, and after
390 Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation China 2014. *Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics
391 Discussions* **15**(8): 12453-12490.
- 392 Li, P., Xin, J., Wang, Y., Li, G., Pan, X., Wang, S., Cheng, M., Wen, T., Wang, G. and Liu,
393 Z. (2014). Association between particulate matter and its chemical constituents of
394 urban air pollution and daily mortality or morbidity in Beijing City. *Environmental
395 Science and Pollution Research* **22**(1): 358-368.
- 396 Li, P., Xin, J., Wang, Y., Wang, S., Li, G., Pan, X., Liu, Z. and Wang, L. (2013). The acute
397 effects of fine particles on respiratory mortality and morbidity in Beijing, 2004–2009.
398 *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* **20**: 6433–6444.
- 399 Li, R., Mao, H., Wu, L., He, J., Ren, P. and Li, X. (2015b). The evaluation of emission
400 control to PM concentration during Beijing APEC in 2014. *Atmospheric Pollution
401 Research*.
- 402 Li, T. T., Cui, L. L., Chen, C., Sun, Q. H., Liu, Y., Wang, Q., Du, Y. J., Du, Z. H. and Xu, D.
403 Q. (2015c). Air pollutant PM_{2.5} related excess mortality risk assessment in
404 Beijing, January 2013. *Disease Surveillance* **30**(8): 668-671.
- 405 Li, Y., Wang, W., Kan, H., Xu, X. and Chen, B. (2010). Air quality and outpatient visits
406 for asthma in adults during the 2008 Summer Olympic Games in Beijing. *Sci Total
407 Environ* **408**(5): 1226-1227.
- 408 Lin, H., An, Q., Luo, C., Pun, V. C., Chan, C. S. and Tian, L. (2013). Gaseous air pollution
409 and acute myocardial infarction mortality in Hong Kong: A time-stratified
410 case-crossover study. *Atmospheric Environment* **76**: 68–73.
- 411 Lin, H., Liu, T., Xiao, J., Zeng, W., Li, X., Guo, L., Xu, Y., Zhang, Y., Vaughn, M. G., Nelson,
412 E. J., Qian, Z. and Ma, W. (2016a). Quantifying short-term and long-term health
413 benefits of attaining ambient fine particulate pollution standards in Guangzhou,
414 China. *Atmospheric Environment* **137**: 38-44.
- 415 Lin, H., Tao, J., Du, Y., Liu, T., Qian, Z., Tian, L., Di, Q., Rutherford, S., Guo, L., Zeng, W.,
416 Xiao, J., Li, X., He, Z., Xu, Y. and Ma, W. (2016b). Particle size and chemical
417 constituents of ambient particulate pollution associated with cardiovascular
418 mortality in Guangzhou, China. *Environmental Pollution* **208, Part B**: 758-766.

- 419 Lin, H., Zhang, Y., Liu, T., Xiao, J., Xu, Y., Xu, X., Qian, Z., Tong, S., Luo, Y., Zeng, W. and
420 Ma, W. J. (2014). Mortality reduction following the air pollution control measures
421 during the 2010 Asian Games. *Atmospheric Environment* **91**(2014): 24-31.
- 422 Liu, J. C., Wilson, A., Mickley, L. J., Ebisu, K., Wang, Y., Sulprizio, M. P., Peng, R. D., Yue,
423 X., Son, J.-Y. and Anderson, G. B. (2016). Exposure to Wildfire-specific Fine Particulate
424 Matter and Risk of Hospital Admissions in 369 Urban and Rural Counties in the
425 Western US 2004-2009.
- 426 Ma, W., Zeng, W., Zhou, M., Wang, L., Rutherford, S., Lin, H., Liu, T., Zhang, Y., Xiao, J.
427 and Zhang, Y. (2015). The short-term effect of heat waves on mortality and its
428 modifiers in China: An analysis from 66 communities. *Environment International* **75**:
429 103-109.
- 430 Mindell, J. and Joffe, M. (2004). Predicted health impacts of urban air quality
431 management. *Journal of epidemiology and community health* **58**(2): 103-113.
- 432 Ministry of Environmental Protection of China (2012). Ambient air quality standards
433 (GB 3095-2012).
- 434 Monn, C. (2001). Exposure assessment of air pollutants: a review on spatial
435 heterogeneity and indoor/outdoor/personal exposure to suspended particulate
436 matter, nitrogen dioxide and ozone. *Atmospheric environment* **35**(1): 1-32.
- 437 Peng, R. D., Samoli, E., Pham, L., Dominici, F., Touloumi, G., Ramsay, T., Burnett, R. T.,
438 Krewski, D., Le Tertre, A. and Cohen, A. (2012). Acute effects of ambient ozone on
439 mortality in Europe and North America: results from the APHENA study. *Air Quality,*
440 *Atmosphere & Health*: 1-9.
- 441 Rich, D. Q., Kipen, H. M., Huang, W., Wang, G., Wang, Y., Zhu, P., Ohman Strickland, P.,
442 Hu, M., Philipp, C. and Diehl, S. R. (2012). Association between changes in air
443 pollution levels during the Beijing Olympics and biomarkers of inflammation and
444 thrombosis in healthy young adults. *JAMA* **307**(19): 2068-2078.
- 445 Schwartz, J., Sarnat, J. A., Coull, B. A. and Wilson, W. E. (2007). Effects of exposure
446 measurement error on particle matter epidemiology: a simulation using data from a
447 panel study in Baltimore, MD. *Journal of Exposure Science and Environmental*
448 *Epidemiology* **17**: S2-S10.
- 449 Shi, H., Wang, Y., Chen, J. and Huisinigh, D. (2016). Preventing smog crises in China
450 and globally. *Journal of Cleaner Production* **112**: 1261-1271.
- 451 Tao, J., Zhang, L., Zhang, Z., Huang, R., Wu, Y., Zhang, R., Cao, J. and Zhang, Y. (2015).
452 Control of PM_{2.5} in Guangzhou during the 16th Asian Games period: Implication for
453 hazy weather prevention. *Science of The Total Environment* **508**: 57-66.
- 454 Wen, W., Cheng, S., Chen, X., Wang, G., Li, S., Wang, X. and Liu, X. (2015). Impact of
455 emission control on PM_{2.5} and the chemical composition change in
456 Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei during the APEC summit 2014. *Environmental Science and*
457 *Pollution Research*: 1-13.
- 458 World Health Organization (2000). Evaluation and use of epidemiological evidence
459 for environmental health risk assessment: Guideline document.
- 460 World Health Organization (2001a). Quantification of health effects of exposure to air

- 461 pollution. Copenhagen: WHO Regional Office for Europe (EUR/01/5026342).
- 462 World Health Organization (2001b). Quantification of health effects of exposure to air
463 pollution: report on a WHO working group, Bilthoven, Netherlands 20-22 November
464 2000.
- 465 World Health Organization (2003). Health aspects of air pollution with particulate
466 matter, ozone and nitrogen dioxide: report on a WHO working group, Bonn, Germany
467 13-15 January 2003.
- 468 World Health Organization (2006). Air Quality Guidelines: Global Update 2005:
469 Particulate Matter, Ozone, Nitrogen Dioxide and Sulfur Dioxide, World Health
470 Organization.
- 471 World Health Organization (2014). Burden of disease from ambient air pollution.
472 Global Health Observatory Data. [http://www.who.int/gho/phe/outdoor_air_](http://www.who.int/gho/phe/outdoor_air_pollution/burden_text/en/)
473 [pollution/burden_text/en/](http://www.who.int/gho/phe/outdoor_air_pollution/burden_text/en/).
- 474 Wu, S., Deng, F., Niu, J., Huang, Q., Liu, Y. and Guo, X. (2010). Association of heart rate
475 variability in taxi drivers with marked changes in particulate air pollution in Beijing in
476 2008. *Environ Health Perspect* **118**(1): 87.
- 477 Zheng, Y., Che, H., Zhao, T., Xia, X., Gui, K., An, L., Qi, B., Wang, H., Wang, Y. and Yu, J.
478 (2016). Aerosol optical properties over Beijing during the world athletics
479 championships and victory day military parade in August and September 2015.
480 *Atmosphere* **7**(3): 47.
- 481